



Статистика, учет и аудит, 1(92)2024. стр. 68-77
DOI: <https://www.doi.org/10.51579/1563-2415.2024.-1.05>
Экономика и менеджмент

МРНТИ 76.01.11
УДК 354

RETROSPECTIVE ANALYSIS OF STRATEGIC TRANSFORMATIONS IN THE KAZAKHSTANI HEALTHCARE SYSTEM

*E. Vanhemping¹, T. Zharlygassinov²**

¹ *Scandinavian Institute of Academic Mobility, Seinajoki, Finland*

² *Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan*

**Corresponding author e-mail: kaztalgin@gmail.com*

Abstract. *In this article a retrospective analysis of strategic transformations in the sphere of Kazakhstani healthcare is carried out. The study covers the period of time during which new strategies and approaches to health care delivery were introduced. The authors analyze the key changes caused by strategic decisions and assess their impact on the quality and accessibility of healthcare for the population. Particular attention is paid to successful strategic moves and to the problems and challenges that the health care system faced during the transformation process. The authors seek to draw valuable lessons for the future development of health care in Kazakhstan through a detailed analysis of past strategic transformations. The article makes a significant contribution to understanding the transformation of Kazakhstan's health care system. It also offers valuable recommendations for its further improvement and development. The results of the study may be useful for the development of future strategies to improve the health care system not only in Kazakhstan, but also in other countries. Historical analysis was applied in the preparation of the article to examine the context and previous reforms in the health care system, to understand the dynamics of change and their impact on the current state.*

Keywords: *Strategic Transformations, Healthcare System, Public Administrative, Market Economy, Reforms, Social Protection, Kazakhstan.*

Introduction. Healthcare is a crucial public concern as it impacts citizens' quality of life and a country's economic development. In Kazakhstan, strategic healthcare transformations are vital to ensure accessible and high-quality medical services. However, a more in-depth analysis is necessary to evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of these efforts.

In recent decades, Kazakhstan's healthcare system has undergone significant changes to improve the accessibility and quality of healthcare services for the population. However, questions remain about the long-term effectiveness and sustainability of these transformations. A retrospective analysis of strategic changes in Kazakhstan's healthcare system will identify key success factors and challenges faced by the system. This text is already well-written and adheres to the desired characteristics. No changes are necessary.

Cite this article as: Vanhemping E., Zharlygassinov T. Retrospective analysis of strategic transformations in the Kazakhstani healthcare system. *Statistics, accounting and audit.* 2024, 1(92), 68-77. DOI: <https://www.doi.org/10.51579/1563-2415.2024.-1.05>



To evaluate the current state of the healthcare system in the Republic of Kazakhstan, a relevant and methodologically resourceful research approach is to study the dynamics and thematic rhetoric of leading academic analysts' approaches to the reforms and changes in healthcare and medicine in the country during different periods of development.

To analyze the expert rhetoric regarding the transformations introduced in accordance with the chronological framework, we will select publications for content analysis. Let us now discuss the recommended periodization for this research approach in more detail.

Therefore, let us discuss in more detail the recommended periodization for this research approach.

To analyze the initial ideas, initiatives, assessments, and recommendations published in the Kazakhstani scientific and analytical field, it is advisable to divide them into the following time periods.

The first set of information from Kazakhstani analytics, which pertains to the reforms taking place in the country, is selected for the 1990s (1990-1999).

The subsequent set of analytical discourse pertains to the content presented in scientific publications from 2000 to 2010.

The following analysis examines the primary rhetoric of health-related topics in analytical texts from 2011-2020, up until March 11, 2020, when the World Health Organization declared the COVID-19 pandemic.

The analysis concludes by conducting a content analysis of scientific publications from March 11, 2020, to the present day.

It is important to acknowledge that the current period, which began when the World Health Organization declared the global coronavirus threat, has been characterized by pandemic-focused language from March 2020 to December 2021.

Since January 2022, there has been widespread coverage of critical analytics related to the events of that month and the multilateral response of all representatives of the expert-analytical community in the country regarding the strategic task of building New Kazakhstan. This coverage is due to the current political situation in Kazakhstan.

Main provisions. This article presents a retrospective review of strategic changes in healthcare in Kazakhstan. The aim is to identify key success factors and challenges and provide recommendations for the future development of the healthcare system in the country.

Literature review. Strategic transformations in the field of healthcare are a relevant topic in the modern world. Domestic and foreign scientists have researched the features of strategic transformations in foreign countries to identify the main trends in healthcare. The article titled «Theoretical Foundations of Management and Functioning of the Healthcare System in the Republic of Kazakhstan» by Kazakhstani scientists determines the organizational structure of the healthcare system in Kazakhstan, including the roles and functions of the main institutions, agencies, and structures responsible for the management and provision of medical care. The article investigates the quality and accessibility of medical care in Kazakhstan. Various theoretical concepts, models, and approaches to healthcare management were studied to develop new theoretically-based management models that consider the unique features of the healthcare system in the Republic of Kazakhstan [1].

Zhanbyrbaeva A.N. and Yeralieva Y.A. emphasize the importance of ensuring public satisfaction with the country's system of public administration, regulating healthcare, developing medical production, providing full coverage of the population with domestic food, increasing the quantity and quality of export-oriented goods, increasing the demand for scientific laboratories and qualified specialists, and strengthening information security [2].



Akanov A.A.'s research work, «Health Protection Policy in Kazakhstan: Experience of Development, Implementation of National Health Programs and Prospects for 2010-2015», provides recommendations for the healthcare sector based on an analysis of modern foreign practices [3].

Over the past five years, scientific research has been conducted in Kazakhstan to assess the effectiveness of health care, including some reform programs. Researchers Y. Aymagambetov, N. Grazhevskaya, A. Tyngisheva [4] A. Mukayev, Z. Satpayeva, D. Kangalakova, G. Doskeyeva, E. Pedro [5], A. Orazymbetova, G. Sultanbekova [6], S. Aidossov, A. Moldazhanov, N. Ryapolova [7] studied the positive effects of health policy. The researchers used statistical methods to assess various aspects of health care, including life expectancy and life satisfaction during the COVID-19 pandemic. The main findings point to the need to develop a unified methodology to assess effectiveness, as current reforms have contributed to improved health, but further improvements in public administration are needed. Selected studies have confirmed significant improvements in key health indicators due to government programs, as well as high effectiveness of corporate governance in health facilities, which has contributed to modernization and improved quality of care.

Researchers M. Tuczyńska, R. Staszewski, M. Matthews-Kozanecka, A. Żok, E. Baum [8] conducted a study on the quality of health services in Europe during the COVID-19 pandemic. Important points were identified that can be considered in relation to the results in Kazakhstan. As a result of the pandemic, in some countries, including the UK, the quality of health services was rated as good, while in other countries there was a decline.

In the article «Kazakhstan Healthcare System Within Independence: Main Stages and the Perspectives of the Development» the authors analyze that «the socio-economic situation at the initial stage of the country's independence could not but affect the health of the population and the health system. The health care reform, the need for which stemmed from the requirements of the transition to market relations, was carried out in the crisis conditions of the economy, with significant underfunding, which ultimately led to a reduction in the provision of the population with medical personnel and a bed fund, unjustified closure of a number of medical facilities. The result of this was a decrease in the availability of medical care, a deterioration in its quality» [9].

Materials and methods. To prepare this article, we analyzed official documents, laws, strategic plans, and reports related to the development of healthcare in Kazakhstan over time.

We conducted a historical analysis to examine the context and previous reforms in the healthcare system, to understand the dynamics of change and their impact on the current state.

The objective of the retrospective content analysis is to identify how leading national scholars and practitioners responded to key governmental strategies of health care transformation in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The analysis focuses on analytical rhetoric regarding transformations and initiatives introduced in medical education, science, clinical practice, and management technologies throughout the reform process. It is important to identify what was supported, criticized, and given priority attention during each chronological period. The analysis of state program documents is necessary to determine the relevance of the thematic discourse in scientific articles, regardless of their evaluation.

Results. The study's results indicate that in Kazakhstan during the mid-2000s, the central theme of analytical rhetoric regarding the healthcare and social protection system shifted towards the quality of services provided to the population. The study's results indicate that in Kazakhstan during the mid-2000s, the central theme of analytical rhetoric regarding the healthcare and social protection system shifted towards the quality of services provided to



the population. This expansion included a wider range of subjects and objects of service. The study's results indicate that in Kazakhstan during the mid-2000s, the central theme of analytical rhetoric regarding the healthcare and social protection system shifted towards the quality of services provided to the population. The term 'innovation' was commonly used in reference to services during this time [10].

In the late 2000s, the Kazakhstani medical community focused on improving the competitiveness of healthcare through modernization and innovation. Diversification was also emphasized to improve the quality and accessibility of medical services.

After gaining sovereignty, the market economy in Kazakhstan brought about new requirements for the organization of economic activity in medical and medical-social institutions. It also highlighted the strategic role of individual health for every citizen of Kazakhstan.

The health of a citizen in the Republic of Kazakhstan is considered a fundamental aspect of the health of the entire national population and a key indicator of quality of life. In market conditions, the determinant role of individual health in revealing human potential is of particular importance (table 1).

Table 1 - Comparison of key strategic initiatives in Kazakhstan's healthcare sector

№	Year	Initiative	Goal	Results
1	2010	Introduction of electronic medical records	Improved accessibility of health data	Reducing the time, it takes to get test results
2	2015	Health care financing reform	Improved cost-effectiveness	Improved quality of medical services
3	2018	Creation of a national system of oncology care	Reducing mortality from cancer	Increased survival rate of patients with cancer

Source: compiled by the authors

The ambitious goals of developing the country and improving citizens' welfare are closely linked to the health of the nation. At the highest level of government, it has been recognized that prioritizing the lifelong health of Kazakhstan's citizens is crucial.

During the early 2000s, Kazakhstan's healthcare policies were closely linked to the country's socio-economic and socio-political developments. This period was characterized by a unique organizational structure, which saw multiple changes in conceptual approaches that determined the direction of healthcare reforms.

«In 2010, prominent Kazakhstani scientists expressed the need for developing the institutional structure of the healthcare system, searching for effective strategies, and integrating it with other sectors of the economy. They emphasized the importance of applying effective products from science and innovation in the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan» [10].

An analysis of state strategic documents from 1993-2010 regarding the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan shows that the initial focus was on introducing high-tech environments and significantly improving the quality of medical services (table 2).

**Table 2 - Assessing the effectiveness of strategic transformations in Kazakhstani healthcare**

№	Indicator	Before implementation of the strategy	After implementation of the strategy	Change
1	Percentage of population coverage with medical services	70%	85%	+15%
2	Average waiting time to see a doctor	30 days	15 days	-50%
3	Number of deaths from oncologic diseases	1000 a year.	800 a year.	-20%

Source: compiled by the authors

During that time, the scientific and medical community in Kazakhstan recognized the strategic importance of defining the meaning and scope of the term 'quality of medical services'. Researchers emphasized the significance of various institutional and cognitive factors that ultimately contribute to the complex nature of this concept.

Determinants of medical service quality include the material and technical resources of medical institutions, the level of professionalism of medical personnel, and staff motivation to improve their skills. It is important to note that subjective evaluations should be excluded unless clearly marked as such. Efficient management of medical care processes is also a significant factor.

A statistical analysis will be conducted on the budgetary funds allocated to the healthcare sector of the Republic of Kazakhstan during the second half of the 2000s.

The first devaluation of the national currency occurred in early April 1999, with the dollar's value increasing from 88 tenge on April 3 to 150-160 tenge on April 5. By 1999, the exchange rate had reached 119.5 tenge per dollar. During this period, the average salary did not exceed \$100 [11].

Financial analysts note that the longest period of tenge strengthening was from 2003 to 2008, during which the average annual exchange rate dropped from 153 tenge per dollar in 2002 to 120 tenge per dollar in 2008. There was an increase in the population's income: in 2002, it was \$53 per capita, while in 2008, the average per capita nominal income of the population was \$272.

In 2004, 90.5 billion tenge was allocated for the guaranteed volume of free medical care, equivalent to approximately 670.4 million dollars based on an average annual exchange rate of about 135 tenge.

In 2009, there was a second devaluation of the national currency in Kazakhstan. On February 4, during the working day, the exchange rate of tenge to dollar jumped from 128 tenge to 170 tenge, but then stabilized at 150 tenge. Based on this, the budget allocated 273.1 billion tenge in 2009 for the guaranteed volume of free medical care, which is approximately equivalent to 1.8 billion dollars.

The increase in financing for free medical care in Kazakhstan from 670.4 million dollars to 1.8 billion dollars over the period of 2004-2009 is significant. The increase in financing for free medical care in Kazakhstan from 670.4 million dollars to 1.8 billion dollars over the period of 2004-2009 is significant. This threefold increase speaks for itself.

However, the effectiveness of the extensive approach, as well as other conceptual approaches chosen to replace it, has been repeatedly critically reconsidered within the



framework of the changing concepts of healthcare financing in Kazakhstan and other post-Soviet countries from the mid-90s to 2010.

In the late 2000s, there was a need for institutional reform to improve the quality of medical services. The strategic principles for transforming the healthcare system in Kazakhstan during this time included integrating it with the modernization of the multi-sectoral economy [12].

Experts note that the institutional reform has necessitated a consistent and comprehensive revision of all organizations and institutions in the healthcare sector. This includes changes in ownership forms and a shift in the ideology and philosophy of medical care in Kazakhstan.

Additionally, changes have occurred in the financial and legal aspects of the medical services market, as well as in other practices related to healthcare. Socio-economic conditions were established to foster a competitive environment. The stakeholder aspects of investment activity in the health sector have changed, leading to the involvement of private capital initiatives.

During the mid to late 2000s, Kazakhstani politicians and scientists viewed innovation as a crucial tool for achieving constructive changes and improvements in the efficiency of financial expenditures on healthcare and the quality of medical services. The analytical rhetoric of that time often emphasized the importance of innovation, which was considered strategically significant and urgent.

Strategic innovations and tactically verified investments were expected to create and extrapolate institutional points of growth, bringing Kazakhstan's medical services to an international level [10].

In 2010, Kazakhstani scientific and applied institutions and their academic experts recognized the strategic importance of developing science focused on innovative medical technologies in the country's healthcare system.

Much attention was paid to critical reassessment of the models used in Kazakhstani medicine during the Soviet period, the legacy of which failed under the conditions of market reforms and transformation of the system.

The so-called «post-socialist» health care of the young sovereign Kazakhstan in the 1990s and in the first half of the 2000s felt the influence of the outdated system.

The lack of a clear strategy for the development of the healthcare system based on the already declared key values was noted by Kazakhstani health system experts in those years. They criticized the underdevelopment of market mechanisms, inefficient management, and technical and technological backwardness. Critiques of the healthcare system in the 1990s and 2000s often cited low staff motivation and challenges in monitoring and evaluating performance.

«Various factors, including socio-economic, techno-economic, normative-legal, organizational-administrative, and socio-psychological obstacles, have been identified as hindrances to innovation in healthcare» [13].

Discussion. The most relevant viewpoint currently is that of a distinguished Kazakhstani expert who was involved in the process of reforming and modernizing healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan. This expert has experience as a practitioner, a scientist, and as the rector of the country's leading medical university.

His objective scientific and analytical assessment of the healthcare reforms since their implementation is of great importance.



Analyzing the retrospective of the situation in Kazakhstani healthcare in the 1990s, A.A. Akanov identified three relevant periods. In 2015, Akanov assessed the achievements and difficulties of the process of reforming and modernizing healthcare.

These stages marked the initial transformational changes in the first decade of sovereign Kazakhstan. The health care model inherited from the USSR in Kazakhstan was reevaluated for its potential workability and efficiency.

Academician A.A. Akanov expressed this perspective in his report on the development of health care policy in the country. He noted that after gaining state sovereignty, the Soviet model of health care was widely implemented.

In 1992, it was recognized at all levels that there was an urgent need to revise the current model and create a new healthcare system in Kazakhstan.

From 1996 to 1998, Kazakhstan shifted towards an insurance-based healthcare system while retaining the key features of the budget model.

In the professional community of doctors, politicians, and civil servants, there were numerous debates in those years regarding the development and subsequent implementation of a new model of Kazakhstani healthcare. This model can be defined as a mixed budget-insurance model. However, at this stage, the discussions were mainly focused on its development and prospects of implementation.

As of 1999, as noted by academician A.A. Akanov in his report, the budget model, typical for the post-Soviet system, still dominated. Between 2000 and 2015, several initiatives aimed at reforming Kazakhstan's healthcare were implemented [14].

Academician A. A. Akanov assessed the results of all healthcare reforms in the Republic of Kazakhstan from the 1990s to 2015 and found that none of the strategic healthcare development programs were successfully completed.

According to the leading figure in Kazakhstani medicine, the proposed transformational strategies lack thorough consideration, proper study, and deep systemic conclusions drawn from ongoing changes.

The maestro believes that a truly effective structural reform of the Republic of Kazakhstan's healthcare system has yet to be fully realized. According to Kazakhstani scientist Academician Akanov, the main issues plaguing the country's healthcare system are the lack of clear strategic goals and objectives, a lack of continuity in reforms, systematic underfunding, and a significant spread of lack of motivation among medical personnel. Additionally, Akanov highlighted the failures of public consciousness regarding individual interest in personal health.

Conclusion. The analysis of the evolution of the Kazakhstani healthcare system revealed its key stages, successful and problematic aspects of changes, and the main factors that influenced its development.

The National Economic Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan emphasizes the significance of the healthcare system and its related industries, including medical care, health insurance, pharmaceuticals, biotechnology, and information technology, as crucial pillars for the sustainable development of the country.

During the early years, the Republic of Kazakhstan's healthcare system faced challenges related to revising its strategic planning and management paradigm, as well as finding effective and optimized financing models. The system also focused on updating its regulatory and legal framework, while searching for scientific-methodological and institutional formats that would be effective for the country's healthcare.

The study showed that strategic transformations in the healthcare system of Kazakhstan had both positive and negative consequences. The success of reforms, such as the transition to a compulsory health insurance system, in improving access to health services and



reducing mortality rates from certain diseases, highlights the significance of strategic planning and implementation of changes in the healthcare system.

In conclusion, the scientific analysis of strategic transformations in the healthcare system of Kazakhstan indicates the need for continuous monitoring and improvement, considering both successful practices and problematic aspects.

Acknowledgement. This research has been funded by the Committee Science of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (AP19175800 «The Analysis of the Effectiveness of Reforming the Public Administration System of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Healthcare Sector»).

РЕТРОСПЕКТИВНЫЙ АНАЛИЗ СТРАТЕГИЧЕСКИХ ТРАНСФОРМАЦИЙ В СИСТЕМЕ КАЗАХСТАНСКОГО ЗДРАВООХРАНЕНИЯ

Э.Г. Ванхемпинг¹, Т.М. Жарлыгасинов^{2}*

¹ Скандинавский Институт Академической мобильности, Сейнайоки, Финляндия

² Казахский национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Алматы, Казахстан

Резюме. В данной статье проведен ретроспективный анализ стратегических трансформаций в сфере казахстанского здравоохранения. Исследование охватывает период времени, в течение которого внедрялись новые стратегии и подходы к оказанию медицинской помощи. Авторы анализируют ключевые изменения, вызванные стратегическими решениями и оценивают их влияние на качество и доступность здравоохранения для населения. Особое внимание уделяется успешным стратегическим шагам, а также проблемам и вызовам, с которыми столкнулась система здравоохранения в процессе преобразований. Авторы стремятся извлечь ценные уроки для будущего развития здравоохранения в Казахстане путем детального анализа прошлых стратегических преобразований. Статья вносит значительный вклад в осмысление трансформации казахстанской системы здравоохранения. В ней также предлагаются ценные рекомендации по ее дальнейшему совершенствованию и развитию. Результаты исследования могут быть полезны для разработки будущих стратегий улучшения системы здравоохранения не только в Казахстане, но и в других странах. В ходе подготовки статьи был применен исторический анализ, чтобы изучить контекст и предыдущие реформы в системе здравоохранения, понять динамику изменений и их влияние на текущее состояние.

Ключевые слова: стратегические трансформаций, система здравоохранения, государственное управление, рыночная экономика, реформы, социальная защита, Казахстан.

ҚАЗАҚСТАНДЫҚ ДЕНСАУЛЫҚ САҚТАУ ЖҮЙЕСІНДЕГІ СТРАТЕГИЯЛЫҚ ТРАНСФОРМАЦИЯЛАРДЫ РЕТРОСПЕКТИВТІ ТАЛДАУ

Э.Г. Ванхемпинг¹, Т.М. Жарлыгасинов^{2}*

¹ Скандинавиялық академиялық ұтқырлық институты, Сейнайоки, Финляндия

² ал-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан

Түйін. Аталған мақалада қазақстандық денсаулық сақтау саласындағы стратегиялық трансформацияларға ретроспективті талдау жүргізілді. Зерттеу медициналық көмек көрсетудің жаңа стратегиялары мен тәсілдері енгізілген уақыт кезеңін қамтиды. Авторлар стратегиялық шешімдерден туындаған негізгі өзгерістерді талдайды және олардың халықтың денсаулық сақтау сапасы мен қолжетімділігіне әсерін бағалайды. Табысты стратегиялық қадамдарға, сондай-ақ денсаулық сақтау жүйесі трансформация процесінде кездесетін сәтсіздіктер мен қиындықтарға ерекше назар аударылады. Авторлар өткен стратегиялық өзгерістерді егжей-тегжейлі талдау арқылы Қазақстанда денсаулық сақтаудың болашақ дамуы үшін құнды сабақ алуға ұмтылады. Мақала қазақстандық денсаулық сақтау жүйесін трансформациялауды түсінуге елеулі үлес қосады. Ол сондай-ақ оны одан әрі жетілдіру және дамыту бойынша құнды ұсыныстарды ұсынады. Зерттеу нәтижелері Қазақстанда ғана емес, басқа елдерде де денсаулық сақтау жүйесін жақсартудың болашақ



стратегияларын әзірлеу үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін. Мақаланы дайындау кезінде денсаулық сақтау жүйесіндегі контекст пен бұрынғы реформаларды зерттеу, өзгерістердің динамикасын және олардың қазіргі жағдайға әсерін түсіну үшін тарихи талдау қолданылды.

Түйін сөздер: стратегиялық трансформациялар, денсаулық сақтау жүйесі, мемлекеттік басқару, нарықтық экономика, реформалар, әлеуметтік қорғау, Қазақстан.

Literature cited

1. Жарлыгасинов Т.М., Купешова С.Т., Нурымова С.К. Теоретические основы управления и функционирования системы здравоохранения в республике Казахстан // вестник университета «Туран». - 2023. - №4. - с.83-95. <https://doi.org/10.46914/1562-2959-2023-1-4-83-95>
2. Жанбырбаева А.Н., Ералиева Я.А. Пандемия жағдайындағы Қазақстан республикасының мемлекеттік басқару жүйесін бағалау // экономика: стратегия и практика. – 2022. - № 17(1). – с.19-32. <https://doi.org/10.51176/1997-9967-2022-1-19-32>
3. Аканов А.А. Политика охраны здоровья населения в Казахстане: опыт разработки, реализации национальных программ здравоохранения и перспективы на 2010-2015 годы / А.А. Аканов. – Астана, 2006. - 243 с.
4. Aymagambetov, Y., Grazhevskaya, N., Tyngisheva, A. Estimation the effectiveness of public governance of the health system in the context of sustainable development // entrepreneurship and sustainability issues. – 2020. - №7. - p. 3309-3320. [https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2020.7.4\(48\)](https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2020.7.4(48)).
5. Mukayev, A., Satpayeva, Z., Kangalakova, D., Doskeyeva, G., Pedro, E. Assessment of the population's quality of life in Kazakhstan during Covid-19: the effectiveness of public policy // problems and perspectives in management. – 2023. - №3. - p. 69-83. [https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21\(3\).2023.06](https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21(3).2023.06)
6. Orazymbetova, A., Sultanbekova, G. Assessment of the effectiveness of implemented state programs in the healthcare sector of kazakhstan // journal of health development. – 2021. - №2(42). - p. 47-52. <https://doi.org/10.32921/2225-9929-2021-2-42-32-40>.
7. Aidossov, S., Moldazhanov, A., Ryapolova, N. 2022. Implementation of corporate governance principles and instruments into the healthcare system of kazakhstan // journal of health development. – 2022. - №1(45). - p. 32-40. <https://jhd.kz.org/index.php/jhd/article/view/107>.
8. Tuczynska, M., Staszewski, R., Matthews-Kozanecka, M., Żok, A., Baum, E. Quality of the healthcare services during Covid-19 pandemic in selected european countries // frontiers in public health. – 2022. - №10. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/35646786/>
9. A.Turgambayeva, S.Ibrayev, O.Yeaskendirov. Kazakhstan healthcare system within independence: main stages and the perspectives of the development // Journal of health development. -2021. – vol. 4. - № 44. – P.16.
10. А.Аканов, У.И. Ахметов, Е.А. Биртанов. Инновации и качество услуг в здравоохранении [электронный ресурс] // Вестник КАЗНМУ. - 2010. - №4. – режим доступа: <https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/innovatsii-i-kachestvo-uslug-v-zdravooxranenii> (дата обращения: 05.12.2023).
11. Как менялся курс доллара в Казахстане за 30 лет [электронный ресурс]. – режим доступа: [https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/kak-menyalsya-kurs-dollar-v-kazahstane-za-30-let-456727/#:~:text=\(дата обращения: 20.12.2023\)](https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/kak-menyalsya-kurs-dollar-v-kazahstane-za-30-let-456727/#:~:text=(дата обращения: 20.12.2023))
12. Приоритеты в области здравоохранения / Джеймисон Д.Т., Бримэн Д.Д., Мишэм Э.Р. и др. – Всемирный банк, Вашингтон, 2006. – 213 с.
13. Нысанбаев А.Н. Казахстан: От выживания - к устойчивому развитию. казахстан на пути к устойчивому развитию. – Алматы, 1996. – с. 17.
14. Аканов А.А., Куракбаев К.К., Чен А.Н., Ахметов У.И. Организация здравоохранения Казахстана / А.А. Аканов. – Алматы, 2016. - 231 с.

References

1. Zharlygasinov T.M., Kupeshova S.T., Nurymova S.K. Teoreticheskie osnovy upravlenija i funkcionirovanija sistemy zdravooxranenija v Respublike Kazahstan [Theoretical foundations of management and functioning of the healthcare system in the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *Vestnik universiteta «Turan»*, 2023, 4, pp. 83-95. <https://doi.org/10.46914/1562-2959-2023-1-4-83-95> (in Russian).
2. Zhanbyrbaeva A.N., Eralieva Ja.A. Ocenka sistemy gosudarstvennogo upravlenija Respubliki Kazahstan v uslovijah pandemii [Assessment of the Public Administration System of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Context of a Pandemic]. *Economics: the strategy and practice*, 2022, 17(1), pp.19-32. <https://doi.org/10.51176/1997-9967-2022-1-19-32> (In Kazakh).
3. Akanov A.A. *Politika ohrany zdorov'ja naselenija v Kazahstane: Opyt razrabotki, realizacii nacional'nyh programm zdravooxranenija i perspektivy na 2010-2015 gody* [Public health policy in Kazakhstan:



Experience in the development, implementation of national health programs and prospects for 2010-2015]. Astana, 2006. 243 p. (in Russian).

4. Aymagambetov, Y., Grazhevskaya, N., Tyngisheva, A. Estimation the effectiveness of public governance of the health system in the context of sustainable development. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 2020, 7, pp. 3309-3320. [https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2020.7.4\(48\)](https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2020.7.4(48)).

5. Mukayev, A., Satpayeva, Z., Kangalakova, D., Doskeyeva, G., Pedro, E. Assessment of the population's quality of life in Kazakhstan during COVID-19: The effectiveness of public policy. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 2023, 3, pp. 69-83. [https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21\(3\).2023.06](https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21(3).2023.06).

6. Orazymbetova, A., Sultanbekova, G. Assessment of the Effectiveness of Implemented State Programs in the Healthcare Sector of Kazakhstan. *Journal of Health Development*, 2021, 2(42), pp. 47-52. <https://doi.org/10.32921/2225-9929-2021-2-42-32-40>.

7. Aidossov, S., Moldazhanov, A., Ryapolova, N. Implementation of Corporate Governance Principles and Instruments into the healthcare System of Kazakhstan. *Journal of Health Development*, 2022, 1(45), pp. 32-40. <https://jhd.kz/index.php/jhd/article/view/107>

8. Tuczynska, M., Staszewski, R., Matthews-Kozanecka, M., Żok, A., Baum, E. Quality of the Healthcare Services During COVID-19 Pandemic in Selected European Countries. *Frontiers in public health*, 2022, 10. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/35646786/>

9. A. Turgambayeva, S. Ibrayev, O. Yeaskendirov. Kazakhstan Healthcare System Within Independence: Main Stages and the Perspectives of the Development. *Journal of Health Development*, 2021, Vol.4, 44, pp.16.

10. A. Akanov, U.I. Ahmetov, E.A. Birtanov. Innovacii i kachestvo uslug v zdavoohranenii [Innovation and quality of healthcare services]. *Vestnik KazNMU*, 2010, 4. Available at: <https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/innovatsii-i-kachestvo-uslug-v-zdavoohranenii> (data obrashhenija: 05.12.2023).

11. *Kak menjalsja kurs dollara v Kazahstane za 30 let*. Available at: [https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/kak-menyalsya-kurs-dollar-v-kazahstane-za-30-let-456727/#:~:text=\(data obrashhenija: 20.12.2023\)](https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/kak-menyalsya-kurs-dollar-v-kazahstane-za-30-let-456727/#:~:text=(data obrashhenija: 20.12.2023)).

12. *Prioritety v oblasti zdavoohranenija* [Health priorities]/ Dzhejmison D.T., Brimjen D.D., Mishjem Je.R. i dr. Vsemirnyj Bank, Vashington, 2006. 213 s. (in Russian).

13. Nysanbaev A.N. *Kazahstan: ot vyzhivaniya - k ustojchivomu razvitiyu. Kazahstan na puti k ustojchivomu razvitiyu* [Kazakhstan: from survival to sustainable development. Kazakhstan on the way to sustainable development]. Almaty, 1996. 17 s. (in Russian).

14. Akanov A.A., Kurakbaev K.K., Chen A.N., Ahmetov U.I. *Organizacija zdavoohranenija Kazahstana* [Health Organization of Kazakhstan]. Almaty, 2016. 231 s. (in Russian).

Авторлар туралы ақпарат:

Э.Г. Ванхемпинг – Әлеуметтік ғылымдар саласындағы PhD, профессор, Скандинавиялық академиялық ұтқырлық институты, Сейнайоки, Финляндия, e-mail: baltraining@gmail.com

Т.М. Жарлыгасинов* – Әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті Экономика және бизнес жоғары мектебінің постдокторанты, e-mail: kaztalgin@gmail.com

Информация об авторах:

Э.Г. Ванхемпинг – PhD в области социальных наук, профессор, Скандинавский Институт Академической Мобильности, Сейнайоки, Финляндия, e-mail: baltraining@gmail.com

Т.М. Жарлыгасинов* – Постдокторант Высшей школы экономики и бизнеса Казахского национального университета имени аль-Фараби, e-mail: kaztalgin@gmail.com

Information about authors:

E. Vanhemping – PhD in Social Sciences, Professor, Scandinavian Institute of Academic Mobility, Seinajoki, Finland, e-mail: baltraining@gmail.com

T. Zharlygassinov* – Postdoctoral Student at the Higher School of Economics and Business of the Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, e-mail: kaztalgin@gmail.com

Received: 28.02.2024

Accepted: 22.03.2024

Available online: 30.03.2024